



Report
Staff Report
The Corporation of the City of Brampton
9/17/2024

Date: 2024-08-23

Subject: **Heritage Impact Assessment, 12 Rosegarden Drive – Ward 10**

Contact: Arpita Jambekar, Heritage Planner, Integrated City Planning

Report number: Planning, Bld & Growth Mgt-2024-688

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. That the report from Arpita Jambekar, Heritage Planner, Integrated City Planning to the Brampton Heritage Board Meeting of September 17th, 2024, re: **Heritage Impact Assessment, 12 Rosegarden Drive Ward-10**, dated January 2024 be received;
2. That the Heritage Impact Assessment Report for 12 Rosegarden Drive, prepared by ATA Architects Inc., dated January 2024 be deemed complete; and
3. That the following recommendations as per the Heritage Impact Assessment by ATA Architects Inc. be followed:
 - I. As a result of a fire at 12 Rosegarden Drive in 2023, which has rendered the building unsafe and made it impossible to salvage or restore, the building must be demolished;
 - II. A Commemoration of the property should be erected and placed in Gladstone Shaw Park, immediately west of the property. A Commemoration Plan to guide the commemorative strategy is required to be submitted and must adhere to the city's new Terms of Reference for Commemoration Plans.

OVERVIEW:

- **12 Rosegarden Drive was added to the Municipal Heritage Register in 2016 as a “Listed” cultural heritage resource for its design/physical value, historical/associative value, and contextual value.**
- **An initial Heritage Impact Assessment was prepared in 2021 as part of an application for the construction of a new custom home on the property. The assessment identified that the property meets the requirements for “Designation” under Ontario Heritage Act.**

- In response to staff's recommendation that the property owner consider design options for the new home that would allow for retention of the heritage house, a second HIA was prepared in early 2023 to respond to changes in the proposed design.
- A house fire in June 2023 destroyed the original heritage structure, and a third version of the HIA was prepared to make recommendations to address the loss of the building and the heritage attributes of the property
- This HIA has confirmed that the existing property met the minimum criteria for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, and that the heritage attributes that were identified to meet those criteria have been lost as a result of the fire.
- The HIA recommends that a Commemoration Plan be prepared following the city's Terms of Reference, and that a commemorative plaque be installed in the adjacent, City-owned Gladstone-Shaw Park. The plaque will describe the historical and contextual value that the house and former farm property have to the community.
- The HIA is considered complete, per the City's Terms of Reference.
- There are no financial implications as a result of this report.

BACKGROUND:

Property Description

The property at 12 Rosegarden Drive is situated east of Goreway Drive, north of Castlemore Road, west of McVean Drive and south of Countryside Drive, within the former township of Toronto Gore. The remnants of the historic village of Castlemore lie to the southeast of the subject property. Although the subdivision was constructed around it, the house at 12 Rosegarden remained in its original location on an individual, severed lot as a reminder of the area's rural and agricultural heritage.

The property was listed as a cultural heritage resource in the City's Municipal Heritage register in 2016, for its design/physical value, historical/associative value, and contextual value.

Structure Description

The structure at 12 Rosegarden is a one and a half storey, Late Victorian version of Gothic Revival style farmhouse. The significant heritage attributes include:

- Dichromatic brick,
- Beige brick base with beveled cap,
- Quoins,

- Steeply-pitched gables,
- Lancet windows and,
- Arched-brick window hoods.

The property has high architectural value as the home was owned by a single family for over 100 years. The additions to the structure were sympathetic and the integrity of the heritage attributes was retained. However, the fire of June 2023 has resulted in a loss of the heritage attributes of the farmhouse.

The subject property has high historical/associative value as the land was owned by for 124 years by five generations of the Shaw family. The various members of the Shaw family who operated the Farm were active members in the community involved in religious, social, political and agricultural organizations. In 1967, the farmstead was designated as a Century Farm. As a farmhouse situated in a rural estate setting, it contributed to the understanding of the agricultural history of the city and has the potential to yield information on the importance of the Shaw family to various organizations in the history of Brampton's Toronto Gore.

Although the house was located in a rural estate subdivision, the large lot where it was situated helped to reflect the rural agricultural past of the Toronto Gore and thus the City of Brampton and gave the property a high contextual value.

CURRENT SITUATION:

An initial Heritage Impact Assessment that was prepared for the property by ATA Architects Inc. in 2021 as part of an application for the construction of a new custom home on the property, identified that the property met the requirements for "Designation" under Regulation 9/06 of the Ontario Heritage Act. Based on this result, staff recommended that the property owner consider design options for the new home that would allow for retention of the heritage house.

A subsequent draft of the HIA was prepared in early 2023 to respond to changes in the proposed design.

A house fire in June 2023, resulted in the destruction of the original 1½ storey farmhouse. A third version of the HIA was then prepared (by ATA Architects Inc., dated January 2024) to address the loss of the building and make recommendations to address the loss of the heritage attributes of the property.

The HIA confirmed that the former building met three of the minimum criteria under Ontario Regulation 9/06 and was therefore eligible for Heritage Designation under Section 29 under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

The HIA also documented that the fire resulted in substantial and irreparable damage to the building and the heritage attributes that were previously identified in the criteria for Designation. The part of the structure that remains has evidence of severe smoke and

fire damage, making it unsafe and unfit for any purposes. Since the building's instability makes it impossible to salvage or restore the remainder of the house, the HIA concluded that it must be demolished.

Recommendation and Mitigation measures

The revised Heritage Impact Assessment determined that removal of the farmhouse, due to the fire, will negatively impact the cultural heritage resource. Without the house present on the property, the expression of its architectural and contextual values are lost. The HIA recommends mitigation through Commemoration of the building through signage/plaque/marker as a viable course of action. Formal commemoration should be provided on the adjacent site (Gladstone-Shaw Park) to reference the building and site and describe the historical and contextual value they have to the community.

A Commemoration Plan, based on the City of Brampton's Terms of reference, should be presented to guide the commemorative strategy.

CORPORATE IMPLICATIONS:

Financial Implications:

None.

STRATEGIC FOCUS AREA:

The approval of the Heritage Impact Assessment noted within this report supports the Culture & Diversity Focus Area. The recommendations therein, facilitate commemoration of a rare and unique cultural heritage resource that contributes to the understanding of Brampton's early history, and help maintain a sense of place, belonging and community identity.

CONCLUSION:

It is recommended that the Heritage Impact Assessment for 12 Rosegarden Drive be received by the Brampton Heritage Board as being complete and the recommendation therein be endorsed.

Authored by:

Reviewed by:

Arpita Jambekar
Heritage Planner,
Integrated City Planning

Jeffrey Humble, RPP, MCIP
Manager
Policy Programs and Implementation

Reviewed by:

Reviewed by:

Henrik Zbogar, RPP, MCIP
Director
Integrated City Planning

Steve Ganesh, RPP, MCIP
Commissioner
Planning, Building and Growth Management

Attachments:

- Attachment 1 - Heritage Impact Assessment Report, ATA Architects Inc., Jan. 2024.