

MOTION: SAFER DRIVERS = SAFER ROADS, a call for the Provincial Government to act

Moved by: Santos

ATTACHMENT: Summary of recommendations published by the Auditor General Value – “Value-for-Money Audit: Driver Training and Examination” December 2023

NOTE: The following list of recommendations have been copied directly from the report.

Issue and Recommendations (Pg16-38)

https://www.auditor.on.ca/en/content/annualreports/arreports/en23/AR_drivertraining_en23.pdf:

4.1 Driver Examinations

4.1.1 Novice Drivers from Urban Areas Who Took Road Tests at Rural or Suburban Drive Test Centres Were Involved in More Collisions

1. So that driver examinations effectively assess whether novice drivers are sufficiently prepared to drive safely on Ontario’s roads, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
 - assess the impact on road safety of novice drivers from urban areas taking their road tests at rural and suburban DriveTest Centres; and
 - based on that assessment, identify and put in place reasonable restrictions that prohibit urban novice drivers from taking their road test at a DriveTest Centre outside of where they live, work or study.

4.1.2 Ministry Reduced the Requirements for the G (Highway) Road Test Without a Full Review and Formal Evaluation of Road Safety Impacts

2. To understand the full impact of the reduced G (highway) road test and make evidence-based decisions about the reduced test, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
 - conduct a thorough policy analysis of the impact of the reduced G (highway) road test, including the impact related to drivers from countries with no reciprocal driver’s licence exchange agreement with Ontario;
 - track and compare the collision rates of drivers who pass the reduced G (highway) road test to those who passed the full G (highway) road test over a sufficient period of time to determine if it increases road safety risk; and
 - based on these analyses, determine whether it is appropriate to continue to use the reduced G (highway) road test.

4.1.3 Novice Drivers Can Repeat the Knowledge Test as Many Times as Necessary in One Sitting to Pass

3. To encourage novice drivers to study the rules of the road more effectively prior to attempting the G1 knowledge test, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation review best practices in other jurisdictions, such as Quebec and British Columbia, and determine whether it should introduce a wait period before an individual can retake the test or limit the number of tests that can be taken in a single day.

4.2 Driver Training

4.2.1 Drivers Allowed to Shorten Their G1 Supervised Driving Period Were Involved in More Collisions

4. So that novice drivers are better prepared to drive safely on Ontario’s roads, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
 - review and identify opportunities to enhance the effectiveness of the Beginner Driver Education program (program) for novice drivers, including the sufficiency of the existing minimum number of driving practice hours;
 - based on leading practices in other jurisdictions, reassess the time discount provision that allows novice drivers to shorten the supervised driving period after the completion of the program;

Continued 4 of 7

MOTION: SAFER DRIVERS = SAFER ROADS, a call for the Provincial Government to act

Moved by: Santos

- based on its review of these areas, implement necessary changes to improve the program; and subsequent to making changes to the program, determine whether all novice drivers should be required to complete the program.

4.2.2 Ministry Provided Limited Guidance Regarding Necessary Driving Practices for New Drivers Compared to Other Jurisdictions

5. So that novice drivers are well prepared to drive safely on Ontario roads, and to protect the integrity of the Ministry's driver examination process, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
- review the types of driver training services available in the marketplace (including the practice of route training) and assess their impact on novice drivers and on the integrity of the driver examination process;
 - based on that assessment, propose regulatory changes to prohibit driver training services that compromise the Ministry's ability to assess the driving skills of novice drivers through the Ministry examination process; and
 - implement monitoring and enforcement tools to deter prohibited driver training services.

4.2.3 Unregulated Driver Training Services May Undermine the Integrity of Driver Examinations

4.2.4 Weak Oversight of Beginner Driver Education Driving Schools

6. To strengthen the oversight of driving schools, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
- develop and implement a formal policy to require timely on-site follow-ups at driving schools where audits identified either serious or a high number of compliance violations to assess if the violations have been resolved;
 - develop and implement a strategy for routinely conducting cost-effective mystery shops on driving schools that it identifies as high-risk; and
 - regularly document and assess progress reported through follow-ups with driving schools to direct the Ministry's future oversight and enforcement actions.

4.3 Graduated Licensing System May Not Adequately Prepare Less-Experienced Drivers from Other Countries to Drive in Ontario

7. To better prepare novice drivers from other countries for driving in Ontario, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
- research whether drivers from other countries have unique challenges that may contribute to their involvement in a higher proportion of collisions;
 - reassess the impact of waiving the 12-month wait period between the G1 (knowledge) and G2 (city) road test; and
 - based on the results of Ministry research and reassessment, make necessary changes to the training and examination programs.

4.4 Monitoring High-Risk Licensed Drivers

4.4.1 Ministry Rarely Requires Drivers with Repeat Driving Suspensions to Take Retraining Courses

8. To encourage road safety and provide early remedial measures for drivers with a history of repeat driving offences and suspensions, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
- routinely identify drivers with a record of repeat driving offences and suspensions who Ministry data indicates are at increased likelihood to cause a collision; and
 - expand the criteria for requiring drivers to complete remediation and retraining to include these drivers.

MOTION: SAFER DRIVERS = SAFER ROADS, a call for the Provincial Government to act

Moved by: Santos

4.4.2 Elderly Drivers' Ability to Drive Safely Not Effectively Assessed

9. To enhance road safety for the growing number of elderly drivers, we recommend the Ministry of Transportation review and adopt best practices from other jurisdictions, such as:
- re-examining elderly drivers' driving skills; and
 - requiring regular medical assessments for all Drivers 80 and older.

4.4.3 Reporting of Drivers Who May Be Medically Unfit to Drive Could Be Improved

10. For more complete and timely identification, assessment and suspension of drivers with high medical risks, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation periodically conduct educational and outreach initiatives to increase awareness among doctors, nurses and optometrists to report patients for medical assessment.

4.4.4 Supporting Evidence for Ministry's Medical Suspension Decisions Not Always Complete

11. To help ensure that decisions to suspend driver's licences are based on all medically relevant information, and that the suspension decisions are consistent and adequately supported, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
- redesign the forms doctors use to provide condition-specific medical information to the Ministry to include all necessary information, such as test or treatment results;
 - require medical assessors to consistently document their rationale for decisions related to complex driving suspensions and reinstatements; and
 - implement a quality-assurance process to routinely review the completeness and appropriateness of medical assessments.

4.5 Driver Examination Services Contract Management and Oversight

4.5.1 Ministry's Contract Administration Was Ineffective, and Failed to Improve Driver Examination Services for Ontarians

12. To better motivate the service provider to improve service rather than incur penalties, and to hold the service provider accountable for contract deliverables, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
- design and implement performance measures that incorporate effective penalties for performance failures, including delays in contract deliverables;
 - collect an upfront contingency deposit for performance penalties based on historical records; and
 - design and implement incentives (in addition to penalties) to promote compliance and appropriate responses from the service provider.

13. To promote effective contract management and relations between the Ministry of Transportation and its service provider, and to avoid undermining the contractual position of the Ministry, we recommend that the Ministry ensure that communications with contractors use appropriate contract channels.

4.5.2 Ministry's Compliance Audits of Driver Examination Services Were Inconsistent and Incomplete

14. To better monitor and report on the driver examination service provider's compliance and performance, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation strengthen its audit function by implementing a program of risk-based audits to examine all key operational processes of driver examination services, including road tests.

MOTION: SAFER DRIVERS = SAFER ROADS, a call for the Provincial Government to act

Moved by: Santos

4.5.3 Ministry Paid Additional Funds to Maintain Service Levels That Were the Responsibility of the Service Provider

15. To provide for better accountability of funds provided to third parties for driver examination services to Ontarians, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:

- administer contracts such that risks and costs are allocated between the parties in accordance with contractual terms; and
- conduct thorough reviews on all relief, subsidization or reimbursement requests from service providers and render decisions that are consistent with the Ministry's contractual obligations.

4.5.4 Ministry Awarded New Contract to the Service Provider Despite Poor Performance and Issues of Concern

16. To provide for more effective oversight of driver examination service providers, and to provide Ontarians with better quality of service, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:

- ensure adequate lead time to comply with government policies on procurement when contracting with a service provider;
- consider past performance in negotiating future contracts;
- compare its experience relative to other Canadian provinces to identify best practices in structuring driver examination services; and
- use independent research to immediately evaluate the costs and benefits of various options for an examination service delivery partnership.

4.6 Ministry Overrode Its Own Proof of Identification Requirements When Issuing Driver's Licences

17. To better prevent fraud and identify theft, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:

- develop internal guidelines and formal procedures to evaluate and document the extenuating circumstances for ID escalations;
- educate Serco and ServiceOntario staff on these guidelines and procedures; and
- put in place a process to monitor that these guidelines and procedures are followed.

4.7 Ministry Did Not Incorporate Key Safety Data When Determining the Effectiveness of Its Road Safety Programs

18. To measure the effectiveness of its driver training and examination programs on a timely basis, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:

- expand the use of business intelligence tools to conduct additional analytics that leverage data from related information systems, linking driver information to the driver examination, collisions and driver medical databases;
- establish a comprehensive set of road safety indicators, including those related to collision rates, based on the objectives of its driver training and examination programs; and
- monitor its driver training and examination programs using these indicators, and report on the results annually.