



Report
Staff Report
The Corporation of the City of Brampton
2/18/2025

Date: 2025-01-31

Subject: **Recommendation Report: Heritage Impact Assessment for 17-35 Railroad Street – Ward 1**

Contact: Arpita Jambekar, Heritage Planner, Integrated City Planning

Report number: Planning, Bld & Growth Mgt-2025-127

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. That the report from Arpita Jambekar, Heritage Planner, Integrated City Planning to the Brampton Heritage Board Meeting of February 18, 2025, re: **Recommendation Report: Heritage Impact Assessment for 17-35 Railroad Street – Ward 1**, be received;
2. That the *Heritage Impact Assessment-17-35 Railroad Street, Brampton* by Stantec, dated January 21, 2025 be received;
3. That the following recommendations per the Heritage Impact Assessment by Stantec be followed:
 - I. The following Design guidelines for mitigating the impacts of the proposed development shall be incorporated into the proposed development:
 - i. Plan and Form
 - ii. Architectural Style and Detailing
 - iii. Building Materials
 - iv. Landscaping
 - v. Commemoration
 - II. Site plan controls and vibration monitoring for adjacent properties be developed and implemented including:
 - i. Isolation of properties from construction-related activities.
 - ii. Mapping showing all adjacent properties are to be included in the engineering and construction plans.
 - iii. Stabilization measures and protective barriers be installed during prior to commencement of construction activities.
 - iv. Vibration studies are to be completed by a qualified geotechnical engineer or vibration specialist.

4. That a Documentation and Salvage Plan for 59 Elizabeth Street North and the Railroad CHL be prepared prior to issuance of permits for any demolition works; and
5. That a Heritage Commemoration Plan for 59 Elizabeth Street North and the Railroad CHL be prepared.

OVERVIEW:

- A development is proposed for municipal properties comprising 17 Railroad Street, 19 Railroad Street, 23 Railroad Street, 27 Railroad Street (no structure present), 31 Railroad Street, 35 Railroad Street, 55 Elizabeth Street North, 59 Elizabeth Street North, 48 Mill Street, 50 Mill Street, and 52 Mill Street.
- The proposed development consists of two (2) high-rise residential buildings with heights of 55 and 58 storeys with a 3 to 13 storey terraced building podium. The redevelopment of these properties will require demolition of all of the existing residential structures within the project footprint.
- The properties at 31 Railroad Street and 59 Elizabeth Street are listed on Brampton's Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Resources.
- The subject lands proposed for development are adjacent to the following properties designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act: 44 Mill St N, 45 Railroad Street, 15-19 Church Street West, and 51 Elizabeth Street North (listed).
- A Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) was requested by staff further to a pre-consultation application (PRE-2023-0089) filed with the City in 2023.
- The HIA evaluation determined that the property at 59 Elizabeth Street North and the Railroad Street Cultural Heritage Landscape have Cultural heritage interest or value as they each meet three criteria under Ontario Regulation 9/06 and are eligible for designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- The HIA demonstrated that the proposed development will directly impact the identified cultural heritage resources. Potential direct and indirect impacts are also identified on adjacent listed and designated heritage properties.
- The HIA recommends that design mitigation measures, site plan controls and vibration monitoring measures should be implemented to mitigate the impacts on the heritage resources.
- The HIA also recommends preparation of a Documentation and Salvage Report and a Commemoration Plan for 59 Elizabeth Street North and the Railroad Street Cultural Heritage Landscape.
- The HIA is complete per the City's Terms of Reference.

BACKGROUND:

The lands comprising the properties known as 17 Railroad Street, 19 Railroad Street, 23 Railroad Street, 27 Railroad Street (no structure present), 31 Railroad Street, 35 Railroad Street, 55 Elizabeth Street North, 59 Elizabeth Street North, 48 Mill Street, 50 Mill Street, and 52 Mill Street are proposed for redevelopment. The proposed development consists of a mixed use, multi-unit high rise residential and commercial building consisting of two (2) high rise residential towers with heights of 55 and 58 storeys, with a three to 13-storey terraced building podium. Demolition of all of the properties within the project footprint has been proposed to accommodate the new construction. An HIA was requested as part of the Pre-Consultation submission (PRE-2023-0089) to address impacts within and adjacent to the development footprint. The final version was submitted as part of OZS application (OZS-2024-0032).

The study area is situated on the south side of the current GO Transit and CN Rail Corridor and bound by Railroad Street to the north, Elizabeth Street North to the east, and Mill Street North to the west. The southern limit is defined by adjacent residential properties. The location of the properties is within the Downtown Major Transit Station Area (MTSA) and is therefore intended for intensification of development.

The properties at 31 Railroad Street and 59 Elizabeth Street North are listed on the City of Brampton's Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Resources. The study area is adjacent to designated properties at 44 Mill Street North, 45 Railroad Street, and 51 Elizabeth Street North and listed property at 15-19 Church Street West.

The HIA evaluated all of the properties within the project footprint against the criteria in Ontario Regulation 9/06. Based on the evaluation the property at 59 Elizabeth Street N and the Railroad Cultural Heritage Landscape (CHL) each meet three criteria for Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and are eligible for designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. The remaining properties did not meet the Criteria for Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

Results of Heritage Evaluation

59 Elizabeth Street North (Arlington Hotel)

The property at 59 Elizabeth Street North, formerly known as the Arlington Hotel, was built as a single-family dwelling, likely between 1869 and 1871. A decade following construction it was converted for use as a hotel. In the mid-20th century the property ceased use as a hotel and was converted into apartments and continues with this use to the present day. Though the physical features are largely altered, the multi-unit residence displays Georgian Style influences through the placement of windows, the central entrance, and slightly pitched roof.

59 Elizabeth Street is associated with the growth and expansion of the City of Brampton during the second half of the 19th century. Specifically, it relates to the critical role and effect of the railway on Brampton's economic development and growth. It has direct association with the railroad corridor and CN Railway station at 15-19 Church Street. This is exemplified by its conversion to a hotel to accommodate travellers using the railway, and research indicates that it was the first apartment building in this area.

The property has contextual value for its contribution in maintaining the character of the area through its placement and massing in the immediate vicinity which consists of other one and a half and two-storey dwellings. The property is also historically linked with the adjacent railway corridor and the original Grand Trunk Railway station due to its use as a hotel in late 19th and early 20th century.

Railroad Cultural Heritage Landscape

The Cultural Heritage Landscape (CHL) is composed of the various residential dwellings of different architectural styles on the south of the rail alignment along Railroad Street that were constructed from the mid-19th to early 20th century and whose construction was influenced by the presence of the railway.

The Railroad Street CHL is associated with the growth of Brampton through the presence of working-class residences and a hotel near the railway. The CHL is made up of the residences at 17 Railroad Street, 19 Railroad Street, 31 Railroad Street, 35 Railroad Street, 50 Mill Street North, 52 Mill Street North, 55 Elizabeth Street North and 59 Elizabeth Street North. Together they contribute to the character of the area as an expression of late 19th and early 20th century development along the railway corridor in Brampton.

CURRENT SITUATION:

The HIA determined that the proposed development will have direct impacts on the identified Cultural Heritage value or Interest of the listed properties and the Railroad CHL, because the development plan proposes demolition of all the existing structure within the study area. The massing and the location of the proposed development is anticipated to directly impact the contextual value of the adjacent listed and designated properties as well as the character of the neighbourhood.

Various alternative development approaches were considered to address the impacts of the project. These include:

- Full in-situ retention,
- Relocation and Integration
- Façade retention
- Commemoration through design strategies including podium height and materiality with specific reference to adjacent properties.

A mitigation approach focused on sympathetic design is adopted for mitigating the impacts of the proposed demolition of the buildings within the project footprint. As part of this approach, material design guidelines are provided to guide the following attributes of the proposed development:

- Plan and form,
- Architectural style and detailing,
- Building materials,
- Landscaping, and
- Commemoration.

The use of compatible materials like stone or brick on the podium levels is adopted to create similarity with the surrounding context in terms of material and height. Red brick is used on façade of the first three stories, to respond to the red brick on the heritage building 45 Railroad Street, as well as 44 Mill Street North. Podium heights transition from 13 storeys on the north facing the GO Station down to 3 storeys facing 44 Mill Street North and 51 Elizabeth Street North, minimizing impact. The orientation of the west tower along Mill Street strategically minimizes overlook on the property to the south with additional setback from the property at 44 Mill St N.

The HIA report provides sectional elevations of the proposed development to show how the new structure sits within the neighbourhood. Impacts are further mitigated by delineating construction buffer zones and Site Plan controls. A pre-condition survey, vibration monitoring and post-condition survey are recommended to support ongoing protection for the adjacent properties.

The HIA report recommends preparation of a Documentation and Salvage report to document the existing structures and their surroundings and to confirm heritage attributes worthy of salvage. Some of the potential materials from 59 Elizabeth Street and buildings within the Railroad CHL may include:

- Samples of brick,
- potential interior elements that are associated with property's use as hotel,
- foundation stones, and
- architectural finishes.

The HIA recommends preparation of an Interpretation and Commemoration Plan to guide the reuse and incorporation of the salvaged heritage attributes into the modern building and context where feasible. This is recommended to establish a physical link to the historical use of the properties by including the material in public areas of the development. This can also include incorporating 3D imagery or interactive displays within common spaces.

CORPORATE IMPLICATIONS:

Financial Implications:

None

Other Implications:

None

STRATEGIC FOCUS AREA:

The approval of the Heritage Impact Assessment noted within this report supports the Culture & Diversity and Growing Urban Centres & Neighbourhoods Focus Area. The Heritage Impact Assessment and recommendations therein facilitate reincorporation of salvaged heritage attributes of the neighbourhood into the new development to understand Brampton's early growth and history while facilitating creation of complete communities in the neighbourhood to help maintain a sense of place, belonging, and community identity.

CONCLUSION:

It is recommended that the Heritage Impact Assessment, 17-35 Railroad Street, Brampton be received by the Brampton Heritage Board as being complete.

Authored by:

Reviewed by:

Arpita Jambekar
Heritage Planner
Integrated City planning

Jeffrey Humble, RPP, MCIP
Manager
Policy Programs and Implementation

Approved by:

Approved by:

Henrik Zbogor, RPP, MCIP
Director
Integrated City Planning Department

Steve Ganesh, RPP, MCIP
Commissioner
Planning, Building and Growth
Management

Attachments:

- Attachment 1 – Heritage Impact Assessment Report for 17-35 Railroad Street, dated January 21, 2025
- Attachment 2 –Highlights of the HIA for 17-35 Railroad Street