

Report Staff Report The Corporation of the City of Brampton 2/18/2025

**Date:** 2025-02-04

Subject: Recommendation Report: Heritage Impact Assessment, 30 James Street – Ward 3

**Contact:** Tom Tran, Heritage Planner, Integrated City Planning

**Report number:** Planning, Bld & Growth Mgt-2025-146

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

- That the report from Tom Tran, Heritage Planner, Integrated City Planning, to the Brampton Heritage Board Meeting of February 18, 2024, re: Recommendation Report: Heritage Impact Assessment, 30 James Street – Ward 3, be received;
- 2. That the Heritage Impact Assessment for 30 James Street prepared by AECOM dated December 16<sup>th</sup>, 2024 be deemed complete;
- 3. That the following recommendations as per the Heritage Impact Assessment: 30 James Street be received and followed:
  - I. If it is demonstrated that relocation of the house is not feasible due to no prospective buyers or structural concerns, a Documentation & Salvage Plan and Commemoration Plan must be completed following City's Terms of Reference and accepted by Heritage Staff prior to the issuance of the demolition permit.
  - II. That the project team has confirmed that relocation is not a feasible option due to lack of available sites for relocation both within and beyond the footprint of the project and therefore Documentation and Salvage with Commemoration are the recommended mitigation options.

# OVERVIEW:

- 30 James Street was listed in the Municipal Heritage Register in 2009.
- To support the Environmental Assessment for the Downtown Brampton Flood Protection project, a Cultural Heritage Assessment Report (CHAR) was completed by AECOM in 2020 to determine impacts and suggest overall mitigation strategies for heritage resources adjacent or within the Study Area.

- Out of a total of 28 cultural heritage resources identified by the CHAR, 13 heritage resources would be directly impacted by the project, including 30 James Street and 39 Centre Street South (St. Mary's Catholic Cemetery). Both properties are listed heritage resources in the Register.
- Per the original assessment, the landscaping of 30 James Street and some built features of the cemetery would be affected by the proposed flood conveyance channels to bypass CN rail crossing.
- An amended Environmental Assessment was prepared in October 2024 which proposed an alternative design to minimize the impact on the cemetery lands but that would result in a greater impact to 30 James Street.
- A Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) was prepared for 30 James Street to address the recommendations of the EA Amendment. The HIA identified that the property meets four criteria under Ontario Reg. 9/06.
- The design proposed by the amended EA will have irreversible impacts on the heritage character of the existing listed property. As the property cannot be retained in-situ, and it is not feasible to relocate the house, Documentation, Salvage and Commemoration are the available mitigation strategies.
- The CHAR and HIA are considered complete as per the City's Terms of Reference.

# **BACKGROUND:**

An Environmental Assessment for the Downtown Brampton Flood Protection project (DBFP) was undertaken in 2020. The EA was completed to identify possible flood protection solutions for the City of Brampton's downtown while also considering urban design and land use opportunities for the City. During the EA, city staff worked with CN Rail to achieve a workable solution for the CN crossing of Etobicoke Creek in the south end of the study area, which involves the installation of flood conveyance culverts underneath the adjacent St. Mary's Roman Catholic Cemetery on the east side of the bridge. However, this approach required extensive burial relocation work which was assessed to be complex, costly, and would result in significant delays to the project. As a result, an EA addendum, completed in October 2024, was prepared that documents the selection of a new preferred alternative. The new preferred design moves the flood conveyance works to the west side of the bridge crossing, which requires the removal of the listed heritage property at 30 James Street. The HIA for the property was prepared in December 2024 to evaluate the cultural heritage value of the property and address the impact of the new proposal.

### **Property Location**

The property at 30 James Street is included in the Brampton Municipal Register as a Listed Cultural Heritage Resource. The property is immediately adjacent to the Etobicoke Creek to the East and the CN rail track to the North. The property is located at the James Street cul-de-sac at the east end of Wellington Street East.

### **Structure Description**

The property at 30 James Street is a two-and-half-storey wood frame house clad in red brick that was built in the Edwardian Classicism style around 1905-1907. The house features a hipped roof with plain wide eaves, dormers on the south and east elevations and a front verandah. There is a centred one-storey rear addition that is also wood frame with a brick veneer.

# **CURRENT SITUATION:**

### **HIA Outcome**

### **CHVI of the Structure**

The HIA determined that the property meets 4 criteria under Ontario Regulation 9/06. The house at 30 James Street is a representative example of Edwardian Classicism with the following attributes:

- Red brick veneer;
- Two-and-a-half-storey height with rectangular plan;
- One-storey contemporary rear wing;
- Hipped roof;
- Pediment dormer on south elevation;
- Leaded ground floor windows on the south and west elevations, including one with stained glass;
- Moulded floral motif in wood surround above main entrance on the south elevation;
- Segmentally arched voussoirs with decorative pressed brick 'egg and dart' motif headers;
- Pressed brick 'egg and dart' motif water table along the foundation; and
- Front verandah with Doric half columns atop masonry piers and railing.

In addition, the house located at 30 James Street displays a high degree of craftsmanship since it was built of brick manufactured by the Brampton Pressed Brick

Company. The skill of the bricklayer is evident in the decorative pressed brick labels and unique masonry railing on the verandah.

The subject property has historical associative value since it is directly associated with the Packham family of brickmakers and Andrew Howden Balfour, who operated the local mill. The two-and-a-half storey brick veneer residence that remains on the property today was constructed in the architectural style of Edwardian Classicism by members of the Packham family under the ownership of Charles R.J. Packham, the son of James Packham, between 1905 and 1907. It is believed to reflect the ideas of George C. Packham, a builder and member of the Packham family. His brother, James Packham, established the Packham Pressed Brick Company (later Brampton Brick Company Ltd.) in 1871, which provided high quality red bricks used in the construction of numerous houses in Brampton and the surrounding area. Although the brickmaking business was sold outside the Packham family in 1949, it still survives today as Brampton Brick Ltd. Due to their legacy of brickmaking, the Packham family were significant to the architectural development of the City of Brampton.

In 1919, Andrew Howden Balfour purchased the residence at 30 James Street, where he lived with his family for 55 years, until 1974. Andrew H. Balfour came from a family of esteemed medical doctors from Portobello, Scotland. Unlike his grandfather and father before him, Andrew Howden Balfour was not in the medical profession, instead working as a miller and grain merchant at The Brampton Milling Company, once known as Balfour Mill. In the First World War, Andrew H. Balfour's military service took him to Iraq, India, and South Africa, where he was in charge of supplies and attained the rank of captain. In 1944, Andrew H. Balfour was elected first vice-chairman of the Brampton branch of the Navy League of Canada at the annual meeting held in the Court House. As the local miller and vice-chairman of the local Navy League, he was significant to the community of Brampton

#### Impact Assessment and Mitigation Measures

To accommodate the new preferred option for flood conveyance, the existing structure at 30 James Street cannot be retained in-situ. Specifically, the impacts to 30 James Street are directly related to the grading of the canal realignment. The design indicates the Subject Property will accommodate sloping required to achieve hydraulic objectives.

The HIA identifies that removal of 30 James Street will result in direct adverse impacts to all heritage attributes associated with the property. Retaining the house in situ is preferred but is not feasible due to various engineering constraints and flood mitigation objectives. As such, the following mitigation option is recommended:

Option 3 (Remove all structures and install the new infrastructure)
 Demolition is recommended, as a last resort, as other options are not feasible.
 Documentation, Salvage and Commemoration Plans will need to be prepared by qualified heritage consultant(s) and contractor(s) prior to demolition.
 Documentation may be achieved by using a drone to provides a three-dimensional (3D) model of each building similar to AECOM's UAS system.
 Salvage materials should be determined based on the heritage attributes documented in the report as well as their usability. Commemoration options can include signs, storyboards and interpretive plaques.

### **Next Steps**

Heritage staff will continue to work with the consultant to review the heritage reports for the rest of the properties being directly affected by DBFP as well as with the City's project team to address the recommended mitigation options for 30 James Street.

### **CORPORATE IMPLICATIONS:**

#### **Financial Implications:**

None

#### **Other Implications:**

None

# STRATEGIC FOCUS AREA:

The approval of the Cultural Heritage Assessment and Heritage Impact Assessment noted within this report supports the Culture & Diversity and Growing Urban Centres & Neighbourhood Focus Area. The recommendations therein, facilitate a key flood protection plan to enhance Brampton's downtown revitalization and develop the public realm along Etobicoke Creek to create a downtown destination and identity. It also creates opportunities for the commemoration of a representative heritage resource that contributes to the understanding of Brampton's early history.

#### CONCLUSION:

It is recommended that the Heritage Impact Assessment, 30 James Street be received by the Brampton Heritage Board as being complete.

Authored by:	Reviewed by:
Tom Tran	Jeffrey Humble, RPP, MCIP
Heritage Planner	Manager
Integrated City Planning	Policy Programs and Implementation
Reviewed by:	Reviewed by:
Henrik Zbogar, RPP, MCIP	Steve Ganesh, RPP, MCIP
Director	Commissioner
Integrated City Planning	Planning, Building and Growth Management

### Attachments:

- Attachment 1 Cultural Heritage Assessment Report for DBFP, dated September 2020, by AECOM
- Attachment 2 Heritage Impact Assessment for 30 James Street, dated December 2024, by AECOM
- Attachment 3 DBFP Environmental Assessment amendment, dated October 2024, by TRCA and City of Brampton
- Attachment 4 Highlights of the HIA for 30 James Street