



Report
Staff Report
The Corporation of the City of Brampton
5/20/2025

Date: 2025-05-08

Subject: **Heritage Impact Assessment Recommendation Report for 127, 133 & 133A Main Street South- Ward 3**

Contact: Arpita Jambekar, Heritage Planner, Integrated City Planning

Report number: Planning, Bld & Growth Mgt-2025-413

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. That the report from Arpita Jambekar, Heritage Planner to the Brampton Heritage Board Meeting of May 20, 2025, re: **Heritage Impact Assessment for 127, 133 & 133A Main Street South- Ward 3** be received;
2. That the Heritage Impact Assessment for 127, 133 & 133A Main Street South, by MHBC, dated April 2025 be received;
3. That following the recommendations of the Heritage Impact Assessment be followed to mitigate the substantial negative impacts associated with the removal of existing buildings:
 - I. That the proposed design be developed through incorporation of historic-inspired elements for the new development;
 - II. That a Documentation and Salvage Report be prepared for each of the existing dwellings at 127 and 133 Main Street South per the City of Brampton Documentation and Salvage Report Terms of Reference prior to submission of any demolition permits for the properties;
 - III. That a Commemoration Plan be developed for the dwellings at 127 and 133 Main Street South, for documenting the history of the site and incorporation within the new development. Any proposed commemoration must include elements accessible from the public realm; and
4. That the properties be maintained in good condition until such time the applicant is ready to apply for building permits for the new construction on the property.

OVERVIEW:

- A development proposal comprising the municipal properties at 127 Main St S, 133 Main St S, and 133A Main St S seeks to remove all the existing buildings on the subject lands to accommodate a 16-storey condominium building and townhouses.
- The development lands include two Heritage Properties 127 Main Street South is a listed heritage resource on City's municipal heritage register of Cultural Heritage Resources and 133 Main Street South is a designated heritage property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- The development applicant made a delegation to the Brampton Heritage Board meeting on April 15, 2025 requesting that the Board and Council allow repeal of Designation By-law 33-2006 for 133 Main Street South, as per Part IV, Section 32(1) of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- The subject lands are also located within the proposed Main Street South Heritage Conservation District. As part of the proposed HCD Plan, the properties at 127 and 133 Main Street South are identified as "Character-Defining Buildings" while the property at 133A is noted as a "Non-Character-Defining Building."
- In response to the delegation and request for appeal of the By-law, a Heritage Impact Assessment was requested by Heritage Staff further to a pre-consultation application (PRE-2024-0157) filed in 2024.
- The HIA evaluation determined that the property at 127 Main Street South has cultural heritage interest or value as the property meets three criteria under Ontario Regulation 9/06 and is eligible for designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. The HIA further determined that the property at 133 Main Street South retains design, historical and contextual criteria as noted in the designation By-law for the property.
- The HIA concluded that the proposed development will have major adverse impacts on both the identified cultural heritage resources due to their removal.
- The HIA also evaluated development alternatives and further recommends that design mitigation measures be implemented to mitigate the negative impacts on the heritage resources.
- The HIA recommends preparation of a Documentation and Salvage Report and Commemoration Plan for 127 and 133 Main Street South.
- The HIA is deemed complete per the City's Terms of Reference.

BACKGROUND:

The properties at 127 Main Street South, 133 Main Street South and 133A Main Street South are proposed for redevelopment. The proposed development consists of one sixteen storey condominium building with a six-storey podium and hybrid townhouses along Main Street South with four storey massing. An HIA was requested as part of the pre-consultation submission (PRE-2024-0157) to address impacts within and adjacent to the development footprint.

The subject lands are bound by Harold Street to the southeast and Main Street to the southwest. The subject lands are generally located within a low-rise residential neighborhood of Main Street South, with urban commercial uses to the southeast and multi-storey apartment buildings are located on an adjacent property to the south.

The property at 127 Main Street south is a 2.5 storey Edwardian style dwelling. It is a listed heritage resource included in the City's Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Resources. The property at 133 Main Street South is a two-storey Gothic revival dwelling and is a Designated Heritage property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

The submitted HIA evaluated all three of the properties within the project footprint against the criteria in Ontario Regulation 9/06. Based on the evaluation, the property at 127 Main Street South meets three criteria (Criteria 1, 7 and 8) and therefore has Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and is eligible for designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. The Designated property at 133 Main Street South retains Cultural Heritage Value or Interest as identified in Schedule B of the Designation By-law. The property at 133A Main Street South does not meet the Criteria for Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

The applicant delegated to the Brampton Heritage Board meeting of April 15, 2025 to formally request a repeal of the designation By-law for the property at 133 Main Street South. A conceptual proposal of redevelopment by partial retention for 133 Main Street South and demolition of 127 Main Street South was presented during this delegation. The delegation was received, and the matter was referred to staff for further consideration and a report back to the Brampton Heritage Board on May 20, 2025. Further to this, upon approval from the City Council during the special meeting on April 17, 2025, a Notice of Proposal to Repeal the designation By-law was posted on the City's website on April 28, 2025.

Description of Cultural Heritage Interest or Value for Heritage resources

127 Main Street South

The dwelling located at 127 Main Street South was constructed c. 1920 and is identified as a representative example of the Edwardian architectural style. The following are the identified heritage attributes that contribute to the design /physical value for the property:

- Cut-Stone foundation;
- Original 2.5 storey red brick exterior at north, east and south elevations;

- Shape and pitch of the hip roof with four symmetrical rectangular dormers;
- Original openings including stone sills and lintels; and
- Triangular pedimented portico at the principal elevation including round short doric columns on masonry bases.

The property has contextual value because it is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area (Criteria 7). The dwelling and property contribute to the historic character of the Main Street South neighbourhood with features like the Edwardian style of the dwelling as well as its scale, massing, materials, and setback. The large lot size, landscaping of the property and mature trees also contribute to the historic character of the neighbourhood.

The property is also contextually and historically linked to the property at 133 Main Street South (Criteria 8) because both properties were owned by the Kirkwood family and the dwelling at 127 Main Street South was likely built for David Kirkwood.

133 Main Street South

The Kirkwood house is one of the best examples of a 19th century Gothic Revival home in the City of Brampton. Its triple-gable form is quite unusual for Brampton. The house was built for David Kirkwood and his family about 1876.

The heritage attributes contributing to the design/physical value of the property include:

- Rare triple-gable form with steeply pitched gables;
- polygonal bay windows on front façade;
- symmetrical massing with centre hall plan;
- un-painted red brick masonry laid in stretcher bond;
- dichromatic brick patterning with buff yellow brick utilized to produce quoining, voussoirs and water table;
- predominating window shapes are segmented arched and round-headed windows;
- round-headed double Tuscan window over the two bay windows (front facade);
- central balcony over the main entrance decorated with an iron crest rail;
- Gothic headed opening over the central balcony;
- main entrance with single leaf painted paneled door, rectangular sidelights and panels, an arched three light transom spanning the top of the door, recessed paneled door jamb;
- attached brick stable at rear;
- buff brick voussoirs decorated with projecting brick details in saw tooth or diamond pattern distinguish arches and drop finials decorations are created at ends of certain voussoirs using shaped buff brick; and
- all stone window sills and hand carved motifs in the sills.

The Kirkwood house has historical associative value as it is among the oldest residential properties in the City and symbolizes the contributions of the Kirkwood family - among

the most industrious and historically significant 19th century families in Peel. The property is also associated with commercial development of the City, European settlement patterns, history of carpentry trade and Victorian life in Ontario.

The Kirkwood house contributes to the character of Main Street South with its large, open lot surrounding the house and it is noted for its groupings of deciduous trees, including a rare black walnut tree in the backyard, and other vegetation. These natural and contextual attributes are of great importance. The house holds prominent landmark status along a major roadway. It possesses tremendous visual and aesthetic value and distinctiveness.

The HIA evaluates that the designated heritage property retains Cultural Heritage Value of Interest for its design/physical, historical and contextual values.

CURRENT SITUATION:

The HIA determined that the proposed development will have major adverse impacts on the identified Cultural Heritage Interest or Value of 127 Main Street South and 133 Main Street South, because the development plan proposes demolition of all the existing structures within the subject lands. Additionally, there will be impacts to the contextual value of the heritage resources as well as the character of neighborhood due to removal and isolation of the listed and designated heritage properties.

In determining that demolition and commemoration were the required outcome, the following impact mitigation options were considered, in order:

1. Do Nothing – retain the buildings without alteration;
2. Retain in-situ and incorporate into redevelopment;
3. Relocate existing dwellings onsite or offsite;
4. Incorporate elements or attributes into site redevelopment; and
5. Demolish the existing structures a new and incorporate design elements from the current buildings into the new structure.

Through an analysis of the site and infrastructure requirements for the proposed development it was determined that Options 1-4 are not considered feasible due to significant technical and logistic difficulties as well as viability of the project. Therefore, a mitigation approach focused on sympathetic design is adopted to mitigate the impacts of the proposed demolition of the buildings within the project footprint. The new development will incorporate new design elements which are sympathetic to the lost heritage buildings and the history of the site. The façade for the proposed townhouse portion of the site integrates design elements that are similar to those found in existing properties on site. The elements to be incorporated include foundation style, cladding and brick detailing, entrance details and porch elements. The following elements identified from the heritage properties to be incorporated into the design of the new structure:

- Split face stone foundation red brick cladding,

- spilt face stone windows sills and lintels,
- gothic headed openings,
- recessed arched entries with transom and sidelights,
- entries that include a porch with entablature and columns sitting on stone base,
- buff brick quoins,
- buff brick voussoirs, and
- Polygonal bay windows.

The proposed townhouse frontages are to be mounted on a four-storey section of the building façade with no tower element above it. This is done to act as step down in scale from the proposed 16 Storey tower at the south end of the development through the townhouse section and then to the remainder of Main Street North.

The HIA recommends the preparation of Documentation and Salvage report to document fully the identified cultural heritage resources with photographs and detailed architectural drawings to supplement historic records prior to demolition. Further the Salvage Plan is recommended for the dwellings located at 127 and 133 Main Street south in order to retain historic fabric for potential reuse, as opposed to being deposited in a landfill

The HIA recommends preparation of Commemoration Plan to guide the reuse and incorporation of the salvaged heritage attributes into the modern building and commemorative feature on site. This is recommended so that the history of the site is documented and celebrated as part of the new development.

CORPORATE IMPLICATIONS:

Financial Implications:

None

Other Implications:

None

STRATEGIC FOCUS AREA:

The approval of the Heritage Impact Assessment noted within this report supports the Culture & Diversity and Growing Urban Centres & Neighbourhoods Focus Area. The Heritage Impact Assessment and recommendations therein facilitate reincorporation of salvaged heritage attributes of the neighbourhood into the new development to understand Brampton's early growth and history while facilitating creation of complete communities in the neighbourhood to help maintain a sense of place, belonging, and community identity.

CONCLUSION:

It is recommended that the Heritage Impact Assessment for 127, 133 and 133A Main Street South be received by the Brampton Heritage Board as being complete.

Authored by:

Reviewed by:

Arpita Jambekar
Heritage Planner
Integrated City planning

Jeffrey Humble, RPP, MCIP
Manager
Integrated City Planning

Approved by:

Approved by:

Henrik Zbogar, RPP, MCIP
Director
Integrated City Planning Department

Steve Ganesh, RPP, MCIP
Commissioner
Planning, Building and Growth
Management

Attachments:

- Attachment 1 - Heritage Impact Assessment Report for 127, 133 and 133A Main Street South, by MHBC, dated April 2025
- Attachment 2 – Highlights of HIA for 127, 133 and 133A Main Street South