

Date: 2021-03-24

Subject: Request for Budget Amendment - Barn Reconstruction at Historic Bovaird House

Contact: Sean Cressman, Manager, Building Design and Construction,
Public Works & Engineering, 647.825.4158
sean.cressman@brampton.ca

Report Number: Public Works & Engineering-2021-421

Recommendations:

1. That the report from Sean Cressman, Manager, Building Design & Construction, Public Works and Engineering, to the Committee of Council Meeting of April 14, 2021, re: **Request for Budget Amendment - Barn Reconstruction at Historic Bovaird House**, be received; and
2. That a budget amendment be approved and a new capital project be established in the amount of \$160,000 for the design and approvals to reconstruct the Robinson Barn at the Historic Bovaird House site, with funding to be transferred from Reserve # 4 Repair and Replacement.

Overview:

- **The Historic Bovaird House is located at 563 Bovaird Drive East and is part of a designated heritage property owned by the City of Brampton and operated by the Friends of Historic Bovaird House (FHBH).**
- **In 2016 the existing Robinson Barn, was dismantled from it's previous location in Caledon, was relocated to the City's Sandalwood Public Works yard, and is currently being stored using sea containers and tarps. The condition of the barn wood is unknown, and there will likely be significant replacement and restoration of materials required.**
- **This report seeks direction for the use of the disassembled barn materials and for the resurrection and restoration of the Robinson Barn at the Historic Bovaird House property.**

- **On March 11th, 2021, staff consulted with the FHBH to investigate the opportunity for the FHBH to undertake restoration of the Robinson Barn. It was determined that it is not an option for the FHBH to undertake the barn restoration.**
- **The FHBH advised that they spent \$20,000 to purchase and relocate the barn, and will contribute an additional \$20,000 towards reconstruction. This will be incorporated as a funding source for the future construction funding request.**
- **If the project is to proceed, the estimated project cost is \$800,000. This estimate is comprised of costs for consulting, additional materials and restoration of materials, construction, project management and contingency costs, as outlined in this report.**
- **COVID-19 remains a large risk for project cost estimates at this time, as labour and materials may be experiencing significant price escalation. The lack of available drawings and unknown condition of materials is also a risk to the estimate. For these reasons, staff is recommending only design funding of approximately 20% (\$160,000) be approved at this time, with construction funding to be considered as part of the 2022 budget process after the design is available, the materials have been reviewed, and a more accurate 3rd party estimate can be developed.**

Background:

In 2016 the Friends of Historic Bovaird House (FHBH) acquired the Robinson barn, disassembled and relocated the materials, and stored the materials at the City's Sandalwood Public Works Facility. Barn boards and various materials are being stored in sea cans, and the larger structural members are stored outside under tarps. The condition of the existing materials is unknown to staff, and a consultant's review is required to assess materials and determine what is usable. Engineered drawings of the previous barn are not available.

There are no ongoing costs for the storage of the barn materials. Rodents and the weather pose a risk of deterioration and damage to wood members, particularly the larger members being stored outside. The existing condition of the wood materials is unknown, and there will likely be significant restoration efforts and material replacement required to facilitate reconstruction.

The existing Historic Bovaird House site is a cultural heritage resource located on a designated property. The City owns the Historic Bovaird House facility and property, and conduct maintenance to the site at the City's cost. In 2019 the City completed

construction of an outdoor comfort station on this property, and in 2015 completed construction of a log cabin. If the barn construction project is to proceed, ongoing maintenance costs for this structure would be at the expense of the City.

With the construction of the previous comfort station and log cabin buildings, a careful storm water management review was required with the City and the Region of Peel. Another storm water review exercise is needed if a barn structure is to be built on site. The property does not currently have an off-site storm water connection, this may be a requirement of the Region of Peel for the barn, however it is not known until the storm water review is conducted as part of the barn construction project.

The FHBH operate the facility and site, the group conducts programming and tours. The existing Robinson Barn materials currently in storage are the property of the FHBH.

On April 17, 2019, Council Resolution CW187-2019 was passed, and staff were requested to:

- Provide itemized costs for the City's estimate for the resurrection of the barn on the Historic Bovaird House property; and
- Consult with the Friends of Historic Bovaird House (FHBH) regarding the opportunity to investigate the option of FHBH undertaking restoration of the Robinson Barn.

Current Situation:

Staff are seeking direction from Council on how to proceed for the project to resurrect the Robinson Barn at the Historic Bovaird House property. The project involves the design, approvals, and construction of the barn.

Scope of Work

At this time, accurate drawings and a design of the barn are not available. The current condition of the barn materials in storage is also not known. Based on the March 11th, 2021 conversation with FHBH representatives, the scope of work is understood as outlined below:

- It is believed that all exterior wall cladding and roofing for the barn will need to be new. If there is deterioration or damage to the existing structural members in storage, these may require restoration or need to be new as well.
- There are stone materials in storage as well from the previous barn that would be reincorporated into the new building.
- The future barn is to be an unheated space.
- There will be no washroom or kitchen facilities in the barn.
- The barn is to be one storey.

- The barn will be located to avoid the need for regrading on site.
- The requirements for a sprinkler system are to be reviewed.

Design and construction of the Robinson barn at the Historic Bovaird House site requires the use of a qualified Architect as well as a specialty contractor with experience in the conservation and restoration of heritage buildings. A Heritage Impact Assessment, Heritage Conservation Plan as well as consultation with the Brampton Heritage Board would be required. In addition to these approvals, the project will involve close collaboration with the FHBH.

A type of Site Plan Approval review will be required for this project. In addition, a Building Permit will be required.

A review of the site storm water management is required to construct any additional buildings on the property. A storm water review will be conducted as part of the barn project. It is assumed that there is no major storm water management work required and that a new storm connection to Simmons Boulevard is not required, If the storm water review determines that a new storm line or major site regrading is needed, this will be included in the future construction funding request.

Development Plan

After consultation with the FHBH, it was determined that there is not an opportunity for the FHBH to undertake the barn restoration. Therefore the City of Brampton would need to take on the design and construction costs of the barn rehabilitation.

- **Roles and Responsibilities:** The City would be responsible for hiring a qualified Architect and carrying-out design and approvals, as well as hiring a specialty contractor to conduct restoration and construction of the Barn. The FHBH would be consulted with during the design and site layout process.
- **Estimated Costs to the City:** \$800,000 (to be split into separate design and construction funding requests)
- **Timeline:** 14-18 months from the date of design funding approval, weather and permit approval dependent.

Project Costing

A high level project cost is forecasted at \$800,000. This is comprised of design, heritage studies, testing, project contingencies, construction, contractor fees, restoration and additional materials, as well as project management overhead. The estimated high-level itemized project costs are as follows:

- Design by qualified Architect, permit, heritage studies & soil testing: \$118,000
- Hard cost: construction by specialty Contractor, restoration, fees & additional materials: \$558,000
- Project Management (up to 18 months design + construction): \$42,000
- Project Contingencies (unknowns and COVID-19 escalation & risks): \$68,000
- Non-recoverable tax \$14,000

The FHBH advised that they had been in communication with an Architect, who forecasted a cost per square foot of \$350-\$500 for barn reconstruction. The exact barn measurements are not available, however staff were advised that the barn is approximately 1,100sf, which would have a hard project cost of \$550,000 at \$500/sf.

Given typical annual non-residential inflation costs and unknowns related to COVID-19 materials and labour inflation, the above forecasted hard cost is roughly in line with the FHBH's consultation with the Architect. There is also reduced estimate accuracy at this time, due to the unknown condition of the existing materials, and a lack of available design drawings.

It is recommended that funding for this project be separated into design and construction funding. This would involve approval of initial design funding of approximately 20% (\$160,000), and future construction funding approval for the remaining budget. This allows for design to proceed, and prior to construction funding being requested, a more detailed and accurate cost estimate can be performed. A separate future construction funding request would be more accurate, since a barn design would be available, the condition of wood materials would have been assessed, the storm water management requirements will be known, impacts of COVID-19 escalation would be clearer, and a 3rd party cost estimate could be performed. This request would be made as part of the 2022 budget process.

The FHBH have advised that they will contribute \$20,000 towards this project. Pending a funding agreement being established, staff will incorporate this funding source into the construction funding request in the 2022 budget process.

Corporate Implications:

Heritage Implications:

Policy 2.6.1 of the 2020 Provincial Policy Statement directs municipalities to conserve significant built heritage resources and cultural heritage landscapes. Policy 4.10.8.2 of the City of Brampton Official Plan provides direction to the City of Brampton to protect and maintain its city-owned heritage resources to a good standard to set a model for high standard heritage conservation.

Through fundraising initiatives, the Friends of Historic Bovaird House spent time and efforts to salvage and save the Robinson Barn. This barn is estimated to have been

constructed in 1875. Compared to many other historic barns, the Robinson Barn has a size that is relatively smaller, which is suitable to fit within the site of the Bovaird House. Historically, the Bovaird House was functioning as a farmhouse within an agricultural cultural heritage landscape. The relocation and reconstruction of the Robinson Barn within the vicinity of the Bovaird House is historically appropriate because a barn would have been present on the Bovaird property.

Barns are becoming increasingly rare within the Region of Peel and across Southern Ontario. There is an evident decline in the preservation of rural heritage sites, and our early farming heritage is an important part of Peel and Brampton's history. The restoration and incorporation of the Robinson Barn within the property of the Bovaird House is a key opportunity to conserve and celebrate the agricultural past of the region. There is a lack of opportunities to conserve barns in the context of redeveloping large agricultural properties into new subdivisions. Barns are being lost at a faster rate than heritage farmhouses.

Prior to the Second World War, two thirds of all Canadians lived on a farm, but today most children have never had the opportunity to visit and experience an old barn. Brampton has a unique opportunity to include this barn on the Bovaird house property and contribute to the celebration and remembrance of Brampton's rich agriculture. The reconstruction and incorporation of the Barn within the property will complement the site of the Bovaird House for educational and interpretation purposes, and will provide cultural and tourism benefits to the City.

Purchasing Implications:

If Council directs staff to proceed with the project, a public Procurement Process will be conducted and bid submissions shall be evaluated in accordance with the published evaluation process within the bid document. Purchase approval shall be obtained in accordance with the Purchasing By-law.

All communication with Bidders involved in the procurement must occur formally, through the contact person identified in the Bid Document.

Financial Implications:

Subject to Council approval of the recommendation # 2, a budget amendment will be required and a new capital project will need to be established in the amount of \$160,000 for the design and approvals stage of the project to reconstruct the Robinson Barn at the Historic Bovaird House site; with funding to be transferred from Reserve # 4 Repair and Replacement, which currently has sufficient funding.

Additional funding for the construction phase, which is currently estimated at \$640,000, can be requested for Council's approval after the design is available, the materials have been reviewed, and a more reliable third party estimate can be developed.

Term of Council Priorities:

This report supports the Term of Council Priorities and the 2040 Vision.

Brampton is a Safe & Healthy City: the resurrection of the Robinson Barn on the Historic Bovaird House site strengthens community partnerships through this shared project between the City of Brampton and the Friends of Historic Bovaird House.

Brampton is a Well-Run City: the resurrection of the Robinson Barn on the Historic Bovaird House site reinforces collaboration and advocacy in the community by leveraging the City's relationship with the Friends of Historic Bovaird House in completing this project.

Conclusion:

This report seeks Council direction for the project to reconstruct and restore the Robinson Barn at the Historic Bovaird House site. Existing barn materials are in storage at the City's Sandalwood Public Works Yard, and are the property of the Friends of Historic Bovaird House (FHBH). This report recommends that funding be approved to complete the due diligence and design work. Construction funding is to be requested at a later date after the design is available and unknowns can be resolved.

Authored by:

Reviewed and Recommended by:

Sean Cressman, BDC Manager, Public Works and Engineering

David Bottoni, BDC Director, Public Works and Engineering

Approved by:

Submitted by:

Jayne Holmes, Commissioner (Acting), Public Works and Engineering

David Barrick, Chief Administrative Officer, City of Brampton