

Date: 2021-06-01

Subject: **Alterations to a Property Designated Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act – 18 Grafton Crescent – Ward 10 (H.Ex. 18 Grafton Crescent)**

Contact: **Pascal Doucet, Heritage Planner, pascal.doucet@brampton.ca**

Report Number: Planning, Bld & Ec Dev-2021-721

Recommendations:

1. That the report titled: **Alteration to a Property Designated Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act – 18 Grafton Crescent – Ward 10 (H.Ex. 18 Grafton Crescent)**, to the Brampton Heritage Board Meeting of June 15, 2021, be received;
2. That the Heritage Impact Assessment of the Cassin Farmhouse at 18 Grafton Crescent, dated 03 May 2021, prepared by Megan Hobson (CAHP), Built Heritage Consultant, and attached as Appendix A to this report (the “HIA”) be received and accepted to endorse the proposed conservation, preservation, rehabilitation of the two-storey heritage brick dwelling as well as the demolition of the existing non-heritage one-storey frame addition and the construction of a new contemporary one-storey addition.
3. That City Council approve the alterations to the heritage property at 18 Grafton Crescent, in accordance with section 33 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as amended (the “Act”), with such alterations substantially in accordance with the plans and drawings prepared by SMPL Design Studio Architectural Design Services, dated 2021.03.26, attached as Appendix A to this report, and subject to the following additional conditions:
 - a. That prior to final Site Plan Approval for the property at 18 Grafton Crescent, the owner shall;
 - i. Provide a final Landscape Plan, to the satisfaction of the Commissioner of Planning, Building and Economic Development; and

- ii. Provide final site drawings in accordance with the plans and drawings required in recommendation 3.
- b. That prior to the issuance of any permit for all of any part of the property at 18 Grafton Crescent, including a heritage permit or a building permit, but excluding permits for repairs and maintenance, usual and minor works and work that is not likely to affect a heritage attribute as are acceptable to the Commissioner of Planning, Building and Economic Development, the owner shall:
 - i. Provide building permit drawings in accordance with the plans and drawings required in recommendation 3.

Overview:

- This report recommends that City Council approve the alterations to the heritage property at 18 Grafton Crescent under Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act with the terms and conditions, as set out in this report.
- The property at 18 Grafton Crescent is designated under Part IV, section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as amended (the “Act”). The property contains a two-storey brick house with Gothic-Revival vernacular style and influences and a grouping of mature trees surrounding the house.
- The proposed alterations consist of the removal of the existing non-heritage one-storey entryway and attached garage, to be replaced by the construction of a new contemporary one-storey addition with a new attached garage. The alterations also include the removal of two deciduous trees at the front of the property.
- The alterations will conserve, maintain and integrate the existing original heritage brick house with the new contemporary addition.
- The proposed addition is also subject to approval for Site Plan Control, in accordance with section 41 of the *Planning Act*. The application for Site Plan Approval provides a process that examines the design and technical aspects of the proposed development (City File number: SPA-2021-0014).
- The proposed alterations are considered acceptable under the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, as amended.

Background:

Description of Heritage Property

18 Grafton Crescent is a residential property at the end of the cul-de-sac of Grafton Crescent, located southwest and near the corner of Countryside and the Gore Road. The property contains a two-storey circa 1889 brick house with Gothic-Revival style and influences. This significant heritage dwelling is surrounded by a grouping of mature trees, which also contributes to the property's cultural heritage value. At its meeting of June 20, 2012, City Council passed a by-law designating the property in accordance with Part IV, section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as amended (the "Act"). A copy of the designating by-law is included as part of the HIA attached as Appendix A to this report.

Application History

The City of Brampton received an application for Site Plan Approval to permit the demolition and removal of the existing one-storey entryway and attached garage addition in order to construct of a new one-storey addition. The new addition will be contemporary in design. The alterations will conserve, retain and incorporate the two-storey circa 1889 brick house with Gothic-Revival style and influences, which is the significant built heritage resource of the property. The alterations will conserve and retain the mature trees surrounding the heritage house with the exception of two deciduous trees near the front of the property. On May 12, 2021, the City received an application to alter the designated heritage property in accordance with section 33 of the Act. The application was deemed complete the same day. The application form for altering the designated heritage property is attached as Appendix B to this report.

Heritage Impact Assessment

Attached as Appendix A to this report is the Heritage Impact Assessment by Megan Hobson (CAHP), Built Heritage Consultant, dated 03 May 2021 and titled: *Heritage Impact Assessment of the Cassin Farmhouse at 18 Grafton Crescent* ("HIA"). This HIA was completed by the heritage consultant retained by the owner of the subject property and was received as part of the submission material for the Planning Application and Application made in accordance with section 33 of the Act, all in accordance with the City's Official Plan and the City's Heritage Impact Assessment Terms of Reference. The proposed conservation strategy described in this HIA for the property's heritage attributes and significant resources is supported by City heritage staff, provided that the alterations of the designated heritage property are approved in accordance with the terms and conditions recommended in this report.

Legislative Framework

The property at 18 Grafton Crescent is designated and, therefore, subject to the Act. No heritage attribute can be affected by any alteration without prior approval under section 33 of the Act. Heritage planning staff determined that the proposed alterations to the heritage property will affect the heritage attributes found on the rear (southwest) elevation of the historic building as well as two of the mature trees surrounding the house. The Act provides a period of 90 days for Council to make a decision on the proposed alterations

upon receipt of a complete application and after consultation with the Brampton Heritage Board.

Policy Framework

The proposed alterations to the heritage property at 18 Grafton Crescent are subject to the following policy framework:

The Planning Act

The Planning Act guides development in the Province of Ontario and states that municipalities must have regard for matters of provincial interest. The conservation of features of significant architectural, cultural, historical, archaeological or scientific interest is identified under paragraph 2(d) of the *Planning Act* as a matter of provincial interest.

Provincial Policy Statement (2020)

Development and Site Alterations on or adjacent to designated heritage properties are required to be consistent with the policies under section 2.6 of the 2020 Provincial Policy Statement.

The Provincial Policy Statement directs municipalities and other planning approval authorities in Ontario to conform to policy 2.6.1, which reads as:

2.6.1 Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved.

City of Brampton Official Plan

The proposed alterations are subject to the Cultural Heritage Policies of the Official Plan. More specifically, the policies that are relevant in the context of this report and application to alter the designated heritage property are:

4.10.1.8 Heritage resources will be protected and conserved in accordance with the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, the Appleton Charter for the Protection and Enhancement of the Built Environment and other recognized heritage protocols and standards. Protection, maintenance and stabilization of existing cultural heritage attributes and features over removal or replacement will be adopted as the core principles for all conservation projects.

4.10.1.9 Alteration, removal or demolition of heritage attributes on designated heritage properties will be avoided. Any proposal involving such works will require a heritage permit application to be submitted for the approval of the City.

4.10.1.10 A Heritage Impact Assessment, prepared by qualified heritage conservation professional, shall be required for any proposed alteration, construction, or development involving or adjacent to a designated heritage resource to demonstrate that the heritage property and its heritage attributes are not adversely affected. Mitigation measures and/or alternative development approaches shall be required as part of the approval conditions to ameliorate any potential adverse impacts that may be caused to the designated

heritage resources and their heritage attributes. Due consideration will be given to the following factors in reviewing such applications:

- (i) The cultural heritage values of the property and the specific heritage attributes that contribute to this value as described in the register;
- (ii) The current condition and use of the building or structure and its potential for future adaptive re-use;
- (iii) The property owner's economic circumstances and ways in which financial impacts of the decision could be mitigated;
- (iv) Demonstrations of the community's interest and investment (e.g. past grants);
- (v) Assessment of the impact of loss of the building or structure on the property's cultural heritage value, as well as on the character of the area and environment; and,
- (vi) Planning and other land use considerations.

Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada

The Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada is adopted as part of the City of Brampton Official Plan and is recognized thereunder as an official document to guide planning, development and conservation for heritage resources. Both the owner and the City shall be guided by and apply these Standards and Guidelines, an excerpt of which is hereto as Appendix C.

Current Situation:

Heritage planning staff reviewed the application and submission material for conformity with the Act, the Planning Act, the Provincial Policy Statement (2020), the Cultural Heritage Policies of the City's Official Plan and the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada. The proposed conservation strategy and approach will conserve and rehabilitate the heritage property at 18 Grafton Crescent.

The conservation and alterations of the property are described in the Heritage Impact Assessment and consists of:

- The conservation and retention in situ of the historic building;
- The removal of a portion of the rear wall of the historic building consisting of the southwest elevation of the circa 1889 brick house;
- The construction of a new contemporary one-storey addition replacing the non-heritage and non-significant existing one-storey entryway addition and attached garage;
- The conservation and retention of the mature trees surrounding the heritage house, with the exception of two deciduous mature trees at the front of the property; and
- The planting of new trees at the front of the property.

Design Impact Assessment

The design approach of the new addition is to maintain a low profile so that it is subordinate to the heritage building. The addition will be lower in height than the existing heritage brick structure. A visual separation and transition will be provided between the heritage building and the new addition.

The new contemporary addition will be attached to the rear elevation of the heritage building. The connection will be at the same place as the previous connection, which is minimizing the impact of the new development and site alterations to the heritage fabric and attributes of the house. The alterations and addition are mitigated with an appropriate transition and compatible design.

Proposed Addition

The design, scale and massing of the proposed addition were examined and assessed by urban design and heritage planning staff during the Site Plan Application review process happening in conjunction with this section 33 application. The addition as proposed is a successful example of meeting requirements for a new addition to be subordinate, distinguishable and compatible, all in accordance with the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, as amended.

The physical and visual integrity of the built cultural heritage resource will be conserved by retaining the historic house in situ and by conserving the entirety of the circa 1889 heritage brick house, with the exception of a portion of the original rear wall. The three dimensional legibility of the historic building from the public realm will be maintained after the property is altered. The proposed alterations have been designed in accordance with an approach calling for minimal intervention on the historic fabric of the building. The existing one-storey entryway and attached garage that will be removed for the construction of the new larger one-storey addition were constructed in 2013 and have no cultural heritage significance.

Landscaping Design Assessment

The proposed alterations include the removal of two of the deciduous trees located at the front of the property. This removal will be mitigated by the planting of a line of new trees along the frontage of the property. The other mature trees identified as heritage attributes in the designating by-law will be retained and conserved.

Corporate Implications:

Financial Implications:

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of the recommendations in this report.

Other Implications:

Not applicable.

Term of Council Priorities:

This report has been prepared in full consideration of the Term of Council Priorities (2019-2020).

This report aligns with a 'Mosaic City' by continuing the preservation of heritage properties and cultural heritage resources to support cultural diversity and expression. A Mosaic City reflects the commitment of the City to preserve and protect its cultural heritage. This report also aligns with a 'City of Opportunities', supporting the creation of complete communities by supporting the diversity and distinctiveness of the City through the preservation and conservation of its cultural heritage resources.

Living the Mosaic – 2040 Vision:

The report aligns with the following vision:

- **Vision 5:** in 2040, Brampton will be a rich mosaic of cultures and lifestyle, coexisting **in social responsibility**, respect, enjoyment and justice.

Conclusion:

Heritage City staff has been working with the applicant and heritage consultant to develop and implement a conservation strategy and approach to mitigate the impact of the proposed development and site alterations on the heritage property. The design and landscape impact assessment as well as the proposed alterations and new construction are demonstrating that the property's significant heritage resources will be conserved, all in accordance with the applicable sections and policies of the City of Brampton Official Plan and the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, as amended.

Authored by:

Reviewed by:

Pascal Doucet, MCIP, RPP
Heritage Planner

Jeffrey Humble, MCIP, RPP
Manager, Policy, Program &
Implementation

Approved by:

Submitted by:

Bob Bjerke, MCIP, RPP
Director, City Planning & Design

Richard Forward, MBA, MSc. P. Eng.
Commissioner, Planning, Building and
Economic Development

Attachments:

Appendix A – Heritage Impact Assessment of the of the Cassin Farmhouse at 18 Grafton Crescent, dated 03 May 2021, prepared by Megan Hobson (CAHP), Built Heritage Consultant – 18 Grafton Crescent

Appendix B – Application Form: Application to Alter a Designated Heritage Property in accordance with Section 33, Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, dated May 12, 2021 – 18 Grafton Crescent.

Appendix C – Standards for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada