

Date: 2023-08-14

Subject: Heritage Permit Recommendation Report - 44 Church Street East, Ward 1

Contact: Anastasia Abrazhevich, Assistant Heritage Planner, Integrated City Planning

Report Number: Planning, Bld & Growth Mgt-2023-710

Recommendations:

1. That the report from Anastasia Abrazhevich, Assistant Heritage Planner, dated August 14, 2023 to the Brampton Heritage Board Meeting of September 19, 2023, re: **Heritage Permit Application- 44 Church Street East, Ward 1**, be received;
2. That the Heritage Permit application for 44 Church Street East for the repair of the roof eaves and eaves troughs on the north and west sides of the historic church building be approved.

Overview:

- **In accordance with Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act, alterations to a designated property likely to affect its heritage attributes require written consent from the Council of the municipality in the form of a Heritage Permit.**
- **Previously, the trustee of 44 Church Street East submitted both a Heritage Permit and a Designated Heritage Property Incentive Grant Program application for the repair and replacement of the stone front steps.**
- **Currently, the applicant is seeking a Heritage Permit to repair the roof eaves and eavestroughs on the north and west side of the building.**
- **Heritage Staff recommend approval for issuance of an emergency heritage permit to allow the roof repairs to commence in a timely manner.**

Background:

The property at 44 Church Street East is the site of St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church – a stone Gothic Revival church constructed in 1881 that is designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (the "Act") as a property of cultural heritage value or interest pursuant to By-law 310-89. The property meets the criteria for designation under the categories of design or physical value, historical value, and contextual value.

In accordance with Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act, alterations to a designated property likely to affect its heritage attributes require the written consent of a municipal Council in the form of a Heritage Permit.

Current Situation:

The existing roofing on the church is degraded and unstable. In particular, the roof eaves are in an advanced state of disrepair and in danger of collapsing. This exposes the interior elements of the roof and building to a substantial risk for water infiltration and subsequent damage to the interior of the structure. There is also a risk of damaged elements falling onto areas where they could harm pedestrians. A snow guard will be added to the gutters as part of the roof restoration works to reduce future winter danger by preventing the snow from sliding off the roof. Ongoing maintenance of any property is a requirement for longevity, and this maintenance is critical for 44 Church Street East given its importance as a heritage resource.

The church trustee has submitted a Heritage Permit application for the restoration of the repair of the roof eaves and eavestroughs (gutters) on the north and west sides of the building. This includes the substructure repairs to ends of the roof trusses followed by the installation of new colour-matched metal fascia and crown molding over the substructure and finally the installation of new metal eavestrough to replace the damaged historic sections.

Although the original fascia and crown molding components of the roof eaves are wood, discussions with contractors led to a proposal that metal cladding be used for three main reasons: (1) cost (roughly 50% of the cost), (2) metal is a low maintenance solution for elements exposed to weather conditions as it will not rot, and (3) as the slate roof is nearing the end of its life span and metal components are easier to remove and reuse.

As noted in the engineer's report, the East and South elevations will also require replacement in a few years but given the constraints and limited available funds it is not included in the planned work at this time.

Given the emergency state of this application, staff have issued the heritage permit with the understanding that the Heritage Incentive Grant will be honoured after construction.

Corporate Implications:

Financial Implications:

None

Other Implications:

None

Strategic Focus Area

The approval of the Heritage Permit assists in achieving the outcomes of the Culture & Diversity strategic priority. The approval of this application represents an investment in a local cultural heritage resource and community space.

Conclusion:

Heritage staff recommended that the Heritage Permit application for the roof work proposed at 44 Church Street East be approved.

Authored by:

Reviewed by:

Anastasia Abrazhevich
Assistant Heritage Planner

Jeffrey Humble, RPP, MCIP
Manager, Policy Programs and
Implementation

Approved by:

Approved by:

Henrik Zbogor, Director, Integrated
City Planning

Steve Ganesh, Commissioner of Planning,
Building and Growth Management

Attachments:

- Attachment 1 – Heritage Permit Application and Quotes
- Attachment 2 – Heritage Designation Bylaw 310-89
- Attachment 3 – Site Visit Photos